Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 1 of 19

# EXHIBIT A

I	Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1	Filed 10/04/17 Page 2 of 19
1 2 3 4	SHANNON P. MINTER sminter@nclrights.org AMY WHELAN awhelan@nclrights.org NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS 870 Market Street, Suite 370 San Francisco, CA 94102	ALISON PENNINGTON apennington@centrolegal.org CENTRO LEGAL DE LA RAZA 3400 E. 12th Street Oakland, CA 94601 Telephone: (510) 437-1554 Facsimile: (510) 437-9164
5	Telephone: (415) 392-6257 Facsimile: (415) 392-8442	1 acsimile. (310) +37 910+
6	Attorneys for Amici Curiae	
7	UNITED STATES DIS	TRICT COURT
8	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORM	NIA, SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION
9 10		
11	CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO,	Case No. 3:17-CV-00485-WHO Case No. 3:17-CV-00574-WHO
12	Plaintiff, v.	PROPOSED BRIEF OF THE NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN
13		RIGHTS, CENTRO LEGAL DE LA RAZA, THE TRANSGENDER LAW
14	DONALD J. TRUMP, President of the United States of America, UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, JOHN F. KELLY, Secretary of	CENTER, AND EL/LA PARA TRANSLATINAS AS AMICI
15 16	United States Department of Homeland Security, JEFFERSON B. SESSIONS, Attorney General of the United States, DOES 1-100,	CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF THE PLAINTIFFS' MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT
17 18	Defendants.	Date: October 4, 2017 Time: 2:00 pm Dept.: Courtroom 2, 17th Floor
19	COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA,	Judge: Hon. William H. Orrick
20	Plaintiff,	
21	V.	
22	DONALD J. TRUMP, President of the United States of America, JOHN F. KELLY, in his	
23	official capacity as Secretary of United States Department of Homeland Security, JEFFERSON	
24	B. SESSIONS, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the United States, JOHN MICHAEL	
25 26	"MICK" MULVANEY, in his official capacity as Director of the Office of Management and	
20 27	Budget, and DOES 1-50. Defendants.	
28	Derenualits.	
		1
	Case No. 3:17-cv-00485-WHO; 3:17-cv-00574- WHO	Proposed Brief for the National Center for Lesbian Rights, et al. as Amici Curiae

	Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 3 of 19
1	TABLE OF CONTENTS
2	TABLE OF AUTHORITIESii
3	
4	INTERESTS OF AMICI CURIAE 1
5 6	ARGUMENT 1
7 8	I. THE BAY AREA IS A HAVEN FOR LGBT IMMIGRANTS WHO SUFFER EXTREME PERSECUTION AND VIOLENCE AROUND THE WORLD 1
9 10 11	II. THE PLAINTIFF COMMUNITIES WILL SUFFER IRREPARABLE HARMS IF THEY ARE FORCED TO ABANDON THEIR COMMUNITY FOCUSED POLICIES
12 13	A. Irreparable Harm Regarding Public Safety5
14 15	<ul> <li>B. Irreparable Harms Regarding Public Health, Access To Essential Programs, And The Ability To Combat Discrimination</li></ul>
16	CONCLUSION
17	APPENDIX A
18	
19 20	
20 21	
21	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
II	Case No. 3:17-cv-00485-WHO; 3:17-cv-00574- WHO - i - Proposed Brief for the National Center for Lesbian Rights, et al. as Amici Curiae

ταρί τως αιφιωρίστος
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES
CASES
Avendano-Hernandez v. Lynch, 800 F.3d 1072 (9th Cir. 2015)
<i>Cf. City of Chicago v. Sessions</i> , No. cv-17-c-5720, 2017 WL 4081821 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 15, 2017)
Fyock v. City of Sunnyvale, 25 F. Supp. 3d 1267 (N.D. Cal. 2014)
Fyock v. Sunnyvale, 779 F.3d 991 (9th Cir. 2015)
Hernandez-Montiel v. INS, 225 F.3d 1084 (9th Cir. 2000)
Hispanic Interest Coal. of Ala. v. Governor of Ala., 691 F.3d 1236 (11th Cir. 2012)
Matter of Toboso-Alfonso, 20 I. & N. Dec. 819 (B.I.A. 1990)
New York State Club Ass'n, Inc. v. City of New York, 487 U.S. 1 (1988)
Pitcherskaia v. INS, 118 F.3d 641 (9th Cir. 1997)
<i>Plyler v. Doe</i> , 457 U.S. 202 (1982)
Roberts v. U.S. Jaycees, 468 U.S. 609 (1984)
Schall v. Martin, 467 U.S. 253 (1984)
U.S. v. Salerno, 481 U.S. 739 (1987)
STATUTES
8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)
8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(51)
8 U.S.C. § 1229b(b)
8 U.S.C. § 1231(b)(3)
OTHER AUTHORITIES
Am. Coll. Of Physicians, <i>Immigration Position Statement</i> (2017), https://www.acponline.org/acp_policy/policies/immigration_position_statemen t_2017.pdf
Am. Med. Ass'n, Patient and Physician Rights Regarding Immigration Status H- 315.966 (2017)
Am. Nursing Ass'n, Nursing Beyond Borders: Access to Health Care for Documented and Undocumented Immigrants Living in the US 7–8 (2010)
Asylum Office Workload, March 2016, U.S. Citizenship & Imm. Servs., https://www.uscis.gov/sites/default/files/USCIS/Outreach/Upcoming%20Natio
nal%20Engagements/AffirmativeAsylumStatisticsMarch2016.pdf (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)
Bay Area Census, https://www.bayareacensus.ca.gov (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)
Bill Ong Hing, Immigration Sanctuary Policies: Constitutional and Representative of Good Policing and Good Public Policy, 2 UC Irvine L. Rev. 247, 260

	Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 5 of 19
1	Christy Mallory et al., Discrimination and Harassment by Law Enforcement Officers in the LGBT Community (2015),
2	https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/LGBT- Discrimination-and-Harassment-in-Law-Enforcement-March-2015.pdf10
3 4	Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, G.A. Res. 39/46, U.N. GAOR, 39th Sess., Supp. No. 51, at 197, U.N. Doc. A/RES/39/46 (Dec. 10, 1984)
5	<i>Countries Where Homosexuality Is Criminalized</i> , The Council for Glob. Equal., http://www.globalequality.org/component/content/article/166 (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)
6 7 8	Duncan Tucker, <i>Homophobia In Honduras: Growing Attacks on LGBT Activists</i> , Index on Censorship (Apr. 20, 2016), https://www.indexoncensorship.org/2016/04/magazine-honduras-rainbow- warriors-the-dangers-of-being-an-lgbt-activist
9	Eduardo Morales, Latino Lesbian, Gav, Bisexual, and Transgender Immigrants in the United States, 7:2 J. LGBT Issues Counseling 172 (2013)
10 11	Elizabeth M. McCormick, <i>Federal Anti-Sanctuary Law: A Failed Approach to</i> <i>Immigration Enforcement and A Poor Substitute for Real Reform</i> , 20 Lewis & Clark L. Rev. 165 (2016)
12 13	Emily Waters et al., Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, <i>Lesbian, Gav, Bisexual, Transgender, Oueer and HIV-Affected Hate Violence in 2016</i> , at 7–8 (2017), http://avp.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/NCAVP_2016HateViolence_REPORT.pdf
14 15	Emily Waters et al., Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, <i>Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, and HIV-Affected Hate Violence in 2015</i> (2016), http://avp.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/ncavp_hvreport_2015_final.pdf
16 17	Frank Newport & Gary J. Gates, <i>San Francisco Metro Area Ranks Highest in LGBT Percentage</i> , Gallup (Mar. 20, 2015), http://www.gallup.com/poll/182051/san-francisco-metro-area-ranks-highest-lgbt-percentage.aspx
18 19	Gustavo Lopez & Jynnah Radford, <i>Facts on U.S. Immigrants, 2015</i> , Pew Research Center (May 3, 2017), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2017/05/03/facts-on-u-s-immigrants-current-data
20 21	Human Rights Watch, <i>World Report 2017</i> , at 197 (2017), https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/world_report_download/wr2017- web.pdf
22 23	<i>Immigrants in California</i> , Am. Immigration Council, https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/sites/default/files/research/immi grants_in_california.pdf (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)
24 25	Lynn Tramonte, Immigration Policy Ctr., <i>Debunking the Myth of "Sanctuary Cities</i> " 6 (2011), https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/sites/default/files/research/Com
25 26 27	<ul> <li>munity_Policing_Policies_Protect_American_042611_update.pdf</li> <li>Major Cities Chiefs Ass'n, <i>M.C.C. Immigration Committee Recommendations for</i> <i>Enforcement of Immigration Laws by Local Police Agencies</i> 6 (2006), https://www.majorcitieschiefs.com/pdf/news/MCC_Position_Statement.pdf</li> </ul>
28	Nat'l Inst. of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, <i>HIV Infection and AIDS: An Overview</i> , U.S. Dep't of Health & Human Servs. (Aug. 1, 2002), https://aidsinfo.nih.gov/news/105/hiv-infection-and-aidsan-overview

	Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 6 of 19	
1	Office of Civic Engagement & Immigrant Affairs, <i>Sanctuary City Ordinance</i> , City & Cty. of San Francisco, http://sfgov.org/oceia/sanctuary-city-ordinance-0 (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)	12
2 3 4	Org. for Refuge, Asylum & Migration, <i>Rainbow Bridges: A Community Guide to Rebuilding the Lives of LGBTI Refugees and Asylees</i> 6 (2012), http://oramrefugee.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/oram-rainbow-bridges-2012-web.pdf	4
5	Relationship Between Illegal Immigration Reform & Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996 & Statutory Requirement for Confidentiality of Census Info., 23 Op. O.L.C. Supp. 10 (1999)	5
6 7 8	Sandy E. James et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equal., <i>The Report of the 2015</i> U.S. Transgender Survey (2016), http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/docs/usts/USTS%20Full%20Re port%20-%20FINAL%201.6.17.pdf	10
9 10	Sharita Gruberg, <i>LGBT Undocumented Immigrants Face an Increased Risk of</i> <i>Hate Violence</i> , Ctr. for Am. Progress (June 10, 2014), https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2014/06/10/91233 /lgbt-undocumented-immigrants-face-an-increased-risk-of-hate-violence	6
11	Sonal S. Munsiff, <i>Communicable Disease and Immigration Fears</i> , 9 Am. Med. Ass'n J. Ethics 799, 803 (2007)	10
12 13	Statement from U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement's (ICE) Director Sarah R. Saldaña, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't (Mar. 20, 2015), https://www.ice.gov/news/releases/statement-us-immigration-and-customs- enforcement-ice-director-saldana	5
14 15	The Williams Inst., <i>The LGBT Divide in California</i> 3 (2015), https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/California-LGBT- Divide-Jan-2016.pdf	4
16 17	Tom K. Wong, The Effects of Sanctuary Policies on Crime and the Economy, Ctr. for Am. Progress (Jan. 26 2017, 1:00 AM), https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/reports/2017/01/26/297 366/the-effects-of-sanctuary-policies-on-crime-and-the-economy	8
18 19	Transgender Law Ctr. & Cornell Univ. Law Sch. LGBT Clinic, Report on Human Rights Conditions of Transgender Women in Mexico 14 (2016)	2
20	U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., <i>China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau) 2016 Human Rights Report</i> 66 (2016), https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265540.pdf	2, 3
21 22	U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., <i>El Salvador 2016</i> <i>Human Rights Report</i> 27–28 (2016), https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265798.pdf	3
23 24	U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., <i>Guatemala 2013</i> <i>Human Rights Report</i> 22 (2013),	
24 25 26	<ul> <li>https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/220657.pdf</li> <li>U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., <i>Russia 2016 Human Rights Report</i> 71 (2016), https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265678.pdf</li> </ul>	
20 27 28	U.S. Immigrant Population by Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA), 2011-2015, Migration Policy Inst., http://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/data- hub/charts/us-immigrant-population-metropolitan-area (last visited Oct. 2, 2017)	
		r

# **INTERESTS OF AMICI CURIAE**

The National Center for Lesbian Rights ("NCLR") and other *amici*<sup>1</sup> are direct-services and policy-advocacy organizations working on behalf of immigrant LGBT people and asylum seekers. *Amici* have a special understanding of the severe impact that the January 25, 2017 Executive Order, Enhancing Public Safety in the Interior of the United States, 82 Fed. Reg. 8799, 13,768 (the "Executive Order"), would have on immigrant LGBT people and their families by jeopardizing their access to agencies and services to protect public health and safety such as police and fire departments, healthcare facilities, discrimination enforcement agencies, and other social services.

9

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

# ARGUMENT

10 Amici respectfully submit this brief to assist the Court in analyzing the irreparable harms 11 that San Francisco and Santa Clara would face if the Executive Order is not permanently enjoined 12 and if local jurisdictions are forced to abandon the "sanctuary policies" at issue in this case. Based 13 on *amici*'s extensive work on behalf of LGBT immigrants, many of whom are asylum seekers, and 14 the Bay Area's status as a haven for LGBT people who suffer persecution around the globe, these 15 communities would suffer irreparable harms related to public safety, public health, and the ability 16 to combat discrimination and other forms of abuse. The policies at issue ensure that all community 17 members, and most urgently those most prone to exploitation and abuse, can report crimes and 18 discrimination, and access essential services. Without these protections, the Executive Order 19 would force local jurisdictions to create a permanent underclass of people with reduced access to 20 the police and public services. Such harms are not only irreparable, they are intolerable in 21 communities like San Francisco and Santa Clara that are home to some of the largest immigrant 22 and LGBT communities in the nation.

- \_\_\_
- 23 24

25

26

27

28

### I. THE BAY AREA IS A HAVEN FOR LGBT IMMIGRANTS WHO SUFFER EXTREME PERSECUTION AND VIOLENCE AROUND THE WORLD

LGBT people around the world suffer extreme violence and persecution based on their sexual orientation or gender identity. As of 2011, more than eighty-five countries criminalized sexual conduct between consenting adults of the same sex. *Countries Where Homosexuality Is Criminalized*, The Council for Glob. Equal.,

<sup>1</sup> A full list of *Amici* appear at Appendix A.

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 8 of 19

http://www.globalequality.org/component/content/article/166 (last visited Oct. 2, 2017). And even
 in countries that do not expressly target LGBT people in their laws or policies, LGBT people
 experience unspeakable violence and discrimination. This is especially true in countries from
 which the United States sees the highest numbers of asylum seekers.<sup>2</sup>

5 In China, for example, gay people are subjected to harmful "therap[ies]" intended to "cure" 6 "homosexuality," and textbooks depict "homosexuality as an illness." Human Rights Watch, 7 World Report 2017. 197 (2017),at 8 https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/world\_report\_download/wr2017-web.pdf. No laws protect people from discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity. Id. Domestic violence 9 10 laws do not include same-sex partnerships, leaving LGB people without legal recourse for violence 11 by family members and intimate partners. U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and 12 Lab., China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau) 2016 Human Rights Report 66 (2016), 13 https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265540.pdf.

In Mexico, a 2010 survey found that 83.4% of LGBT Mexicans had faced discrimination
because of their "sexual preference." *See* Transgender Law Ctr. & Cornell Univ. Law Sch. LGBT
Clinic, *Report on Human Rights Conditions of Transgender Women in Mexico* 14 (2016).
Transgender women in Mexico regularly experience harassment and hate crimes. In late 2011, a
group of men in Chihuahua kidnapped and dismembered two transgender women. *Id.* at 15.
Similarly, in June 2012, attackers dismembered the body of a transgender woman in Mexico City. *Id.*

Central American countries are also exceedingly dangerous for LGBT people. In Honduras,
"sexual violence against LGBTI individuals forces them into 'internal displacement' or to flee the
country in search of international protection." Human Rights Watch, *supra*, at 311. The murder
rate of LGBT people jumped to an average of 31 murders per year as of 2009. Duncan Tucker, *Homophobia In Honduras: Growing Attacks on LGBT Activists*, Index on Censorship (Apr. 20,
2016), https://www.indexoncensorship.org/2016/04/magazine-honduras-rainbow-warriors-the-

27

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> These countries are China, Venezuela, Mexico, Guatemala, El Salvador, Honduras, Ecuador, India, Haiti, and Ukraine. *Asylum Office Workload, March 2016*, U.S. Citizenship & Imm. Servs., https://www.uscis.gov/sites/default/files/USCIS/Outreach/Upcoming%20National%20Engageme nts/AffirmativeAsylumStatisticsMarch2016.pdf (last visited Oct. 2, 2017).

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 9 of 19

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

dangers-of-being-an-lgbt-activist. In Guatemala, the police regularly extort LGBT people by waiting outside clubs and bars to demand protection money to avoid jail. U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., Guatemala 2013 Human Rights Report 22 (2013), https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/220657.pdf. The Guatemala Public Ministry has refused to investigate violence against gay men and lesbians. See id. at 23. In El Salvador, at least 11 people were murdered in 2016 because of their sexual orientation, and 52% of transgender people suffered death threats or violence. U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., ElSalvador 2016 Human Rights Report 27 - 28(2016),https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265798.pdf.

10 The trends of abuse and persecution against LGBT people in Eastern Europe, South and 11 Central Asia, and Russia are also alarming. In 2016, a group "savagely beat" patrons of a gay club 12 in Russia. U.S. Dep't of State, Bureau of Democracy, H.R. and Lab., Russia 2016 Human Rights 13 Report 71 (2016), https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/265678.pdf. Police officers 14 systematically abuse and harass LGBT people. Id. In 2015, there were 21 documented cases of 15 abuse or harassment of LGBT individuals by Russian law enforcement. Id. Russian authorities 16 have also banned websites providing online support for the LGBT community. Human Rights 17 Watch, supra, at 498-99. In Pakistan, there have been dozens of threats and attacks against 18 transgender people. Id. at 473. A transgender activist in Pakistan was shot eight times and died 19 "while [hospital] staff debated whether to put her in the male or female ward." Id. In Ukraine, 20 there is continued violence against the LGBT community. In 2016, an LGBT equality festival had 21 to be cancelled when attackers descended on the event. Id. at 624.

22 As a direct consequence of the widespread persecution of LGBT people across the globe, 23 LGBT people seek refuge in the United States, and in the San Francisco Bay Area in particular. 24 The immigrant population of the United States currently totals more than 43.2 million, or 13.4% of 25 the U.S. population. Gustavo Lopez & Jynnah Radford, Facts on U.S. Immigrants, 2015, Pew 26 Research Center (May 3, 2017), http://www.pewhispanic.org/2017/05/03/facts-on-u-s-immigrants-27 current-data. California is home to more than 10 million immigrants, with 27% of its population 28 being foreign born. *Immigrants* in California, Am. Immigration Council,

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 10 of 19

1 https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/sites/default/files/research/immigrants\_in\_californi 2 a.pdf (last visited Oct. 2, 2017). Within California, the Bay Area<sup>3</sup> is unique in that it is a haven for 3 both LGBT people and immigrants. The Bay Area has the highest percentage of LGBT people in 4 the country. Frank Newport & Gary J. Gates, San Francisco Metro Area Ranks Highest in LGBT 5 Percentage, Gallup (Mar. 20, 2015), http://www.gallup.com/poll/182051/san-francisco-metroarea-ranks-highest-lgbt-percentage.aspx.<sup>4</sup> Immigrants constitute approximately 30% of the people 6 in the San Francisco metropolitan area (including Oakland and Hayward)<sup>5</sup> and 37% of the 7 8 population of the Santa Clara, San Jose, and Sunnyvale metropolitan area, making the latter the 9 metropolitan community with the second largest share of immigrants in the United States.<sup>6</sup>

10 Given the millions of immigrants and LGBT people living in the Bay Area, this area of the 11 country has a particular obligation to ensure the safety of LGBT immigrants, protect them from 12 harm, and ensure that they can exercise their right to seek asylum or obtain immigration relief. An 13 estimated 5% of U.S. asylum claims are based on persecution due to one's sexual orientation or 14 gender identity. Org. for Refuge, Asylum & Migration, Rainbow Bridges: A Community Guide to 15 Rebuilding the Lives of LGBTI Refugees and Asylees 6 (2012), http://oramrefugee.org/wp-16 content/uploads/2016/02/oram-rainbow-bridges-2012-web.pdf.<sup>7</sup> Courts have repeatedly afforded 17 protection from deportation to LGBT immigrants in light of the persecution they face in their home countries. See, e.g., Avendano-Hernandez v. Lynch, 800 F.3d 1072, 1080-81 (9th Cir. 2015) 18 19 (granting protection to a transgender woman and recognizing the "unique identities and vulnerabilities of transgender individuals ... in evaluating a transgender applicant's ... claim"); 20 21 Hernandez-Montiel v. INS, 225 F.3d 1084, 1087 (9th Cir. 2000) (granting relief and finding that <sup>3</sup> The San Francisco Bay Area has a population of more than 7 million people in nine counties, 22 including Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, Napa, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Solano, and Sonoma. See Bay Area Census, https://www.bayareacensus.ca.gov (last visited Oct. 2, 2017). 23 The Williams Inst. The LGBT Divide California See also in 3 (2015). https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/California-LGBT-Divide-Jan-2016.pdf 24 (explaining that San Francisco is known to be a "particularly supportive" environment for LGBT people). 25 U.S. Immigrant Population by Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA), 2011-2015, Migration Policy http://www.migrationpolicy.org/programs/data-hub/charts/us-immigrant-population-Inst.. 26 metropolitan-area (last visited Oct. 2, 2017). <sup>6</sup> Id. 27

 <sup>7</sup> The forms of protection-based relief other than asylum include withholding of removal under 8
 U.S.C. § 1231(b)(3) and protection under the Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, G.A. Res. 39/46, U.N. GAOR, 39th Sess., Supp. No. 51, at 197, U.N. Doc. A/RES/39/46 (Dec. 10, 1984).

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 11 of 19

sexual assaults against transgender women "undoubtedly constitute persecution"); *Pitcherskaia v. INS*, 118 F.3d 641, 645, 648 (9th Cir. 1997) (electric shock therapy to "cure" lesbian of her sexual
 orientation amounts to persecution); *Matter of Toboso-Alfonso*, 20 I. & N. Dec. 819, 822 (B.I.A.
 1990) (granting protection to a gay man from Cuba on account of his sexual orientation).

5

6

#### II. THE PLAINTIFF COMMUNITIES WILL SUFFER IRREPARABLE HARMS IF THEY ARE FORCED TO ABANDON THEIR COMMUNITY FOCUSED POLICIES

Due to its history as a refuge for LGBT immigrants, the Bay Area is home to numerous 7 8 organizations, including *amici*, that provide valuable services and support to LGBT immigrant 9 communities. Amici could not fulfill our missions if LGBT immigrants feared that their 10 interactions with police, the courts, and other public officials could result in deportation. This is 11 especially true since so many LGBT immigrants have suffered persecution in their home countries 12 at the hands of law enforcement and without recourse to government protection, creating an increased fear of public officials.<sup>8</sup> Moreover, the trauma that many LGBT immigrants have 13 14 suffered necessitates that the community have access to essential public services. If local 15 communities were forced to abandon their sanctuary policies, they would suffer irreparable harms 16 related to public safety, public health, and the ability to combat discrimination, all of which are 17 compelling state interests.

18

19

# A. Irreparable Harm Regarding Public Safety

Despite seeking refuge in the U.S., there is no question that LGBT people, and LGBT

20 immigrants in particular, remain targets for abuse in this country. LGBT undocumented people

<sup>21</sup> <sup>8</sup> The federal government is well aware of the need to protect information about immigration status in a variety of contexts. The Department of Justice's Office of Legal Counsel recognized nearly 22 20 years ago the "important governmental interests" necessitating complete confidentiality of census information: confidentiality encourages the public to cooperate with census officials by 23 "giv[ing] effective assurance to all persons . . . that the identity of the informant and the information furnished would be held in complete confidence." See Relationship Between Illegal Immigration 24 Reform & Immigrant Responsibility Act of 1996 & Statutory Requirement for Confidentiality of Census Info., 23 Op. O.L.C. Supp. 10 (1999) (citation omitted); see also Statement from U.S. 25 Immigration and Customs Enforcement's (ICE) Director Sarah R. Saldaña, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't (Mar. 20, 2015), https://www.ice.gov/news/releases/statement-us-immigration-and-26 customs-enforcement-ice-director-saldana (stating that when it comes to federal immigration law, "[t]he overriding objective is public safety," that ICE must operate "in a way that upholds the 27 trusted relationships local law enforcement need to build with and among their communities," and that "[a]ny effort at federal legislation now to mandate state and local law enforcement's 28 compliance with ICE detainers will, in our view, be a highly counterproductive step and lead to more resistance and less cooperation in our overall efforts to promote public safety").

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 12 of 19

1 simultaneously belong to three marginalized populations (as an ethnic minority, as an LGBT person 2 and as an undocumented person). As a result, they are at higher risk of encountering severe hate 3 violence and face significant institutional barriers and decreased access to services. Emily Waters 4 et al., Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer and 5 HIV-Affected Hate Violence in 2016, 7 - 8(2017),at http://avp.org/wp-6 content/uploads/2017/06/NCAVP\_2016HateViolence\_REPORT.pdf.; see also Eduardo Morales, 7 Latino Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Immigrants in the United States, 7:2 J. LGBT 8 Issues Counseling 172 (2013). Although undocumented immigrants constitute less than 3% of the 9 LGBT population, they experience nearly 8% of the hate violence. Sharita Gruberg, LGBT 10 Undocumented Immigrants Face an Increased Risk of Hate Violence, Ctr. for Am. Progress (June 11 10, 2014), https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2014/06/10/91233/lgbt-12 undocumented-immigrants-face-an-increased-risk-of-hate-violence. LGBT undocumented people 13 are also 3.4 times more likely to experience sexual violence and 3.5 times more likely to experience 14 physical violence than the general LGBT community. *Id.* 

15 These recognized vulnerabilities of the immigrant community have led Congress to add 16 provisions to U.S. immigration law that are intended to protect public safety. Congress has added 17 provisions that enable survivors of domestic violence (VAWA relief, 8 U.S.C. §§ 1101(a)(51), 18 1229b(b)(2)(A)(i)), survivors of crimes (U-Visa, 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(U)(i)), and survivors of 19 sexual assault or trafficking (T-Visa, 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(T)(i)), for instance, to obtain 20 immigration relief. Indeed, several of these laws explicitly require cooperation with law 21 enforcement. See, e.g., 8 U.S.C. §§ 1101(a)(15)(T)(i)(III), (U)(i)(III). Ironically, Congress has 22 thus legislated into U.S. immigration law the precise public safety issues the federal government 23 would have San Francisco and Santa Clara County abandon: sanctuary policies that prioritize 24 establishing trust with all segments of a community and that empower vulnerable community 25 members to report crimes in order to enhance overall public safety.

These "sanctuary city" policies are better described as "community focused" policies since they prioritize overall public safety by establishing the trust of the entire community. They are essentially "don't ask' policies with respect to [the immigration statuses of] witnesses, victims,

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 13 of 19

and low-level criminal arrests." Bill Ong Hing, Immigration Sanctuary Policies: Constitutional 1 2 and Representative of Good Policing and Good Public Policy, 2 UC Irvine L. Rev. 247, 260 3 (2012). "The idea is that gaining the trust of all parts of the community is important to keeping 4 the entire community safe." Id.

5 This is why the Plaintiff communities in this case support community focused policiessuch policies are essential to protect public safety, a compelling government interest. See, e.g., 6 7 Schall v. Martin, 467 U.S. 253, 264 (1984) (noting that "[t]he 'legitimate and compelling state 8 interest' in protecting the community from crime cannot be doubted" (citation omitted)); Fyock v. 9 City of Sunnyvale, 25 F. Supp. 3d 1267, 1279 (N.D. Cal. 2014) (noting that "[p]ublic safety and 10 crime prevention are compelling government interests" (citing U.S. v. Salerno, 481 U.S. 739, 748– 11 50 (1987)), aff'd sub nom. Fyock v. Sunnyvale, 779 F.3d 991 (9th Cir. 2015). According to the 12 International Association of Chiefs of Police, "local police agencies depend on the cooperation of 13 immigrants, legal and [undocumented], in solving all sorts of crimes and in the maintenance of 14 public order. Without assurances that they will not be subject to an immigration investigation and 15 possible deportation, many immigrants with critical information would not come forward, even 16 when heinous crimes are committed against them or their families." Lynn Tramonte, Immigration Myth Cities" 17 Policy Ctr., Debunking the of *"Sanctuary* 6 (2011),18 https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/sites/default/files/research/Community\_Policing\_P 19 olicies\_Protect\_American\_042611\_update.pdf. "The fear of deportation among immigrant 20 families is so intense that even legal residents and U.S. citizens can be afraid to contact law 21 enforcement unless they know it is 'safe' to do so." Id. at 7. In Austin, Texas, "reports of armed 22 robberies grew by 20 percent, and over 150 serial criminals were arrested" as a direct result of 23 community focused policies. Id.

24

The case of Guatemalan immigrant Danny Sigui illustrates the need for such policies. Mr. 25 Sigui witnessed a murder in Rhode Island and provided key testimony that put the murderer behind 26 bars. Id. at 4. Because the state attorney general reported Mr. Sigui to federal authorities, however, 27 he was deported. When asked if he would have called 911 and testified had he known he could be 28 deported, he responded, "If I had known they would take my liberty, that they would take my

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 14 of 19

1 children away from me, that they would put me [in immigration detention], I would not do this." 2 Id. (alteration in original). Experiences like Sigui's demonstrate why these policies are so 3 important—they encourage individuals to act in the greater public interest. Indeed, if a portion of 4 the public is afraid to report crimes and testify, the police and DA simply cannot effectively 5 investigate and prosecute those crimes. According to police chiefs from the 64 largest police 6 departments in the United States and Canada, "[s]uch a divide between the local police and 7 immigrant groups would result in increased crime against immigrants and in the broader 8 community, create a class of silent victims and eliminate the potential for assistance from immigrants in solving crimes or preventing future terroristic acts." Major Cities Chiefs Ass'n, 9 10 M.C.C. Immigration Committee Recommendations for Enforcement of Immigration Laws by Local 11 Police 6 (2006),Agencies 12 https://www.majorcitieschiefs.com/pdf/news/MCC\_Position\_Statement.pdf. These statements 13 are also consistent with data showing that counties with community focused policies have on 14 average 35.5 fewer crimes committed per 10,000 people. See Tom K. Wong, The Effects of 15 Sanctuary Policies on Crime and the Economy, Ctr. for Am. Progress (Jan. 26 2017, 1:00 AM), 16 https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/reports/2017/01/26/297366/the-effects-of-17 sanctuary-policies-on-crime-and-the-economy.

18 In light of the compelling public safety interests involved in this case, San Francisco and 19 Santa Clara would suffer irreparable harm if they were forced to abandon community focused 20 policies. This fact is borne out by amici's experience with our own clients. When NCLR's client 21 Jose<sup>9</sup> was a victim of kidnapping and rape in San Francisco, he felt safe calling the police and 22 seeking medical care at a San Francisco hospital. Similarly, NCLR's client Liliana, a transgender 23 woman from Mexico, reported her boyfriend to the police after he subjected her to severe domestic 24 violence. She is now applying for a U-Visa. If Jose or Liliana had feared that the police or hospital 25 staff would report their immigration statuses to ICE, they would not have filed police reports or 26 sought critical medical assistance. The policies protect Jose and Liliana directly, while also 27 ensuring that their abusers do not threaten or harm other people.

28

<sup>9</sup> Amici provide only first names in an effort to protect their clients' privacy.

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 15 of 19

1

In short, many cities and counties, like San Francisco and Santa Clara, have determined 2 that using local law enforcement to enforce federal immigration law actually jeopardizes public 3 safety and puts the entire community at risk of harm. These communities will suffer irreparable 4 harm to public safety if they are forced to abandon these policies because of the Executive Order 5 at issue in this case. Cf. City of Chicago v. Sessions, No. cv-17-c-5720, 2017 WL 4081821, at \*13 6 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 15, 2017) (holding that the "harm to [Chicago]'s relationship with the immigrant 7 community if it should accede to the conditions [in the Executive Order] is irreparable [and] cannot 8 be repaired through an award of money damages").

9

10

#### **B**. Irreparable Harms Regarding Public Health, Access to Essential Programs, and the Ability to Combat Discrimination

Community focused policies further ensure that immigrants feel safe reporting 11 discrimination, enrolling in schools and universities, and accessing essential services, such as 12 medical care. In Alabama, one state that passed an anti-sanctuary bill, "there was an immediate 13 drop in attendance in public schools serving the immigrant communities ... and a child's death 14 was reported when his parents delayed seeking medical treatment because they feared that hospital 15 officials would report them to ICE." Elizabeth M. McCormick, Federal Anti-Sanctuary Law: A 16 Failed Approach to Immigration Enforcement and A Poor Substitute for Real Reform, 20 Lewis 17 & Clark L. Rev. 165, 199 (2016). Concerns about how these policies could jeopardize public 18 health have led medical associations and public health experts to take official positions against 19 them. The American College of Physicians, for instance, issued an immigration policy statement 20 explaining that "society has a public health interest in ensuring that all residents have access to 21 health care, particularly for communicable diseases, and that delayed treatment for both 22 communicable and noncommunicable diseases may be costly and can endanger the rest of the 23 population." Coll. Physicians, Immigration Position Statement (2017), Am. Of 24 https://www.acponline.org/acp\_policy/policies/immigration\_position\_statement\_2017.pdf. 25 Similarly, the American Medical Association supports "protections that prohibit ... law 26 enforcement agencies from utilizing information from medical records to pursue immigration

- 27
- 28

enforcement actions against patients who are undocumented." Am. Med. Ass'n, Patient and

Physician Rights Regarding Immigration Status H-315.966 (2017); see also Am. Nursing Ass'n,

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 16 of 19

Nursing Beyond Borders: Access to Health Care for Documented and Undocumented Immigrants Living in the US 7–8 (2010) (advocating for comprehensive healthcare to control the spread of infectious diseases and lower systemic costs, benefiting the entire U.S.); Sonal S. Munsiff, *Communicable Disease and Immigration Fears*, 9 Am. Med. Ass'n J. Ethics 799, 803 (2007) (observing that since "[p]atients who fear and avoid treatment could infect many more people[,] it is in all of society's interest to ensure that all patients with [tuberculosis] are fully and confidentially treated.").

8 Amici have personally experienced the impact of community focused policies on public health. NCLR's client Gustavo, for instance, is a 19-year-old with HIV who suffered extreme 9 10 sexual abuse and violence in Mexico based on his sexuality. Because of San Francisco's 11 community focused policies, he has access to medical care and counseling, protecting his health 12 as well as overall public health.<sup>10</sup> Centro Legal de la Raza's (Centro Legal) client Eduardo is a 13 19-year-old bisexual man from El Salvador who is able to access Post-Exposure Prevention (PEP) 14 treatment, a treatment to prevent infection with HIV. Without assurances that they would not be 15 targeted by law enforcement because of their immigration status, these clients would likely forego 16 the healthcare that protects their lives, as well as the general public.

Many LGBT immigrants, transgender women of color in particular, also face very high
rates of discrimination in the U.S., including interpersonal crime and police abuse. *See generally*Sandy E. James et al., Nat'l Ctr. for Transgender Equal., *The Report of the 2015 U.S. Transgender Survey* (2016),

21 http://www.transequality.org/sites/default/files/docs/usts/USTS%20Full%20Report%20-

%20FINAL%201.6.17.pdf; Christy Mallory et al., *Discrimination and Harassment by Law Enforcement Officers in the LGBT Community* (2015), https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wpcontent/uploads/LGBT-Discrimination-and-Harassment-in-Law-Enforcement-March-2015.pdf;
Emily Waters et al., Nat'l Coalition of Anti-Violence Programs, *Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, and HIV-Affected Hate Violence in 2015* (2016), http://avp.org/wp<sup>10</sup> Viral suppression dramatically improves a person with HIV's ability to thrive and decreases the

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Viral suppression dramatically improves a person with HIV's ability to thrive and decreases the chance of passing HIV on to others. Nat'l Inst. of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, *HIV Infection and AIDS: An Overview*, U.S. Dep't of Health & Human Servs. (Aug. 1, 2002), https://aidsinfo.nih.gov/news/105/hiv-infection-and-aids--an-overview.

# Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 17 of 19

content/uploads/2017/04/ncavp\_hvreport\_2015\_final.pdf. Community focused policies
 encourage the reporting of instances of discrimination and abuse to the relevant authorities, which
 advances the compelling government interest of eliminating discrimination. *See, e.g., New York State Club Ass'n, Inc. v. City of New York*, 487 U.S. 1, 14 n.5 (1988) (recognizing the state's
 "compelling interest in combating invidious discrimination" (internal quotation marks omitted));
 *Roberts v. U.S. Jaycees*, 468 U.S. 609, 623 (1984) (same).

When Centro Legal's client Diego,<sup>11</sup> for instance, experienced severe discrimination at 7 8 work, he was unsure what to do. Co-workers were severely harassing him because he is 9 transgender, and his employer refused to pay him his wages. Because of San Francisco's 10 community focused policies, Diego filed a wage claim with the California Division of Labor 11 Standards Enforcement and a discrimination claim with the Department of Fair Employment and 12 Housing. Without the security of knowing his claims did not put him at risk for deportations, 13 Diego would not have reported these unlawful behaviors, thereby emboldening his harassers and 14 employers to continue their illegal discrimination with impunity.

15 Community focused policies also ensure access to schools. Plyler v. Doe, 457 U.S. 202, 16 218–230 (1982) (holding that denying immigrant children access to public education violates equal 17 protection under the Fourteenth Amendment of the U.S. Constitution); see also Hispanic Interest 18 Coal. of Ala. v. Governor of Ala., 691 F.3d 1236, 1247 (11th Cir. 2012) (noting that "an increased 19 likelihood of deportation or harassment upon enrollment in school significantly deters 20 undocumented children from enrolling in and attending school, in contravention of their rights 21 under *Plyler*"). Indeed, if it were not for community focused policies, Centro Legal's client 22 Jocelyn may not have enrolled her six-year old daughter in school. Similarly, Eduardo and Jocelyn 23 may not have enrolled themselves in community college classes and a vocational training center.

- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

<sup>11</sup> This is a pseudonym for this client.

compelling government interests.

Community focused policies thus play a critical role in protecting public health, ensuring

access to social and educational services, and combatting discrimination, all of which are

1

# CONCLUSION

2	If the Plaintiff jurisdictions in this case are forced to abandon their community focused	
3	policies, they will suffer irreparable harms to public safety, public health, and to the overall	
4	functioning of those communities. It is essential that all members of our community be able to	
5	report crimes and discrimination, and access services such as healthcare. Without these	
6	protections, there would exist a permanent underclass of people with restricted access to the police	
7	and public entities, who are constantly prone to exploitation and abuse. As San Francisco has	
8	already made clear, community focused policies "promot[e] public trust and cooperation[,]	
9	keep our communities safe by making sure that all residents, regardless of immigration status, feel	
10	comfortable calling the Police and Fire Departments during emergencies and cooperating with	
11	City agencies during public safety situations [and] help[] keep our communities healthy by	
12	making sure that all residents, regardless of immigration status, feel comfortable accessing City	
13	public health services and benefit programs." Office of Civic Engagement & Immigrant Affairs,	
14	Sanctuary City Ordinance, City & Cty. of San Francisco, http://sfgov.org/oceia/sanctuary-city-	
15	ordinance-0 (last visited Oct. 2, 2017). Indeed, without these policies, entire criminal enterprises	
16	could arise to prey on immigrants and exploit them in a variety of ways with little recourse for	
17	their victims or effective means for local government to respond.	
18	Accordingly, the National Center for Lesbian Rights, et al., file this brief in support of	
19	the Plaintiffs' Motions for Summary Judgment.	
20	Dated: October 4, 2017 Respectfully Submitted,	
21	By: <u>/s/ Amy Whelan</u>	
22	Amy Whelan NATIONAL CENTER FOR LESBIAN RIGHTS 870 Market Street, Suite 370	
23	San Francisco, CA 94102 Telephone: (415) 392-6257	
24	Facsimile: (415) 392-8442 awhelan@nclrights.org	
25	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
26		
27		
28		
	l	

- 12 -

	Case 3:17-cv-00485-WHO Document 176-1 Filed 10/04/17 Page 19 of 19
1	<u>APPENDIX A</u>
2	The National Center for Lesbian Rights (NCLR) is a national legal non-profit organization
3	committed to advancing the civil and human rights of lesbians, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) individuals and their families. Since 1994, NCLR's Immigration Project has provided free legal assistance to thousands of LCPT immigrants notionwide through among other services direct
4	legal assistance to thousands of LGBT immigrants nationwide through, among other services, direct representation of LGBT immigrants in impact cases and individual asylum cases and advocacy for immigration and asylum policy reform. NCLR has published papers on the topic of gender and
5	sexual orientation-based violence and discrimination, and has filed briefs both as <i>amicus</i> and as counsel of record, regarding asylum claims based on rape, domestic violence, and other forms of
6	gender and sexual orientation-based persecution before various federal courts.
7	Centro Legal de la Raza ("Centro Legal") was founded in 1969 to provide culturally and linguistically appropriate legal aid services to low-income residents of Oakland's Fruitvale District
8	and the greater Bay Area. Centro Legal's Immigration Program provides legal representation and consultations to detained and non-detained immigrants, refugees, and asylum-seekers throughout
9	Northern California. Annually, Centro Legal de la Raza advises and/or represents hundreds of individuals seeking relief before the immigration courts, Board of Immigration Appeals, and the Court of Appeals. As Centro Legal represents and provides assistance to many asylum-seekers and
10	people seeking protection-based relief due to harm suffered or feared based on gender identity and sexual orientation, it has a substantial interest in the present case.
11 12	Transgender Law Center (TLC) is the nation's largest organization dedicated to advancing the
12	rights of transgender and gender nonconforming people. TLC strives to change law, policy, and attitudes so that all people can live safely, authentically, and free from discrimination regardless of
13	their gender identity or expression. TLC pursues a multidisciplinary approach to advocacy, including impact litigation, policy advocacy, and a legal helpline that serves more than 1,500 people
15	each year. The work of TLC includes the Immigration Detention Project, which works to improve conditions for transgender immigrants and improve their access to culturally competent legal
16	representation. Many transgender immigrants and their attorneys contact TLC for assistance
17	El/La Para Translatinas (El/La) is an organization for transgender Latinas (TransLatinas) that works to build collective vision and action to promote the survival of TransLatinas and improve their quality of life in the San Francisco Bay Area. El/La Para Translatinas provides individual case
18	management services, mental health counseling referrals, a food program, workshops, and community networking activities. El/La also focuses on anti-violence work and seeks to promote
19	the overall safety and well-being of Translatinas in the Bay Area.
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25 26	
26 27	
27	
20	